

May 30, 2017

VIA EMAIL & US MAIL

Mr. Dan Jonasson
 City of Minot Public Works Director
 1025 31st St. SE
 Minot, ND 58701

**Subject: Bid Review Opinion
 City Contract No. 4195.1
 Sundre Raw Water Supply Reservoir and Pump Station**

Mr. Jonasson,

The following review was performed on the bids received for the referenced project. Three Bids were received for the Project, and three bids were conforming with the requirements to be opened. PKG Contracting, Inc. of Fargo, North Dakota was the apparent low bidder and Rice Lake Construction Group of Deerwood, Minnesota and ICS Inc. of Grand Forks, North Dakota also submitted conforming Bids. Upon full tabulation of the Bids, it was discovered that ICS had an error of \$5,000 in the total bid amount but this error did not affect the order of the bids. Once all bid prices were checked, PKG was confirmed to be the Low Bidder with a margin of \$290,422.00.

BIDDING INFORMATION REVIEW:

The following table summarizes the bids received from the three (3) bidders that submitted on the project: (1) PKG Contracting Inc.; (2) Rice Lake Construction Group; and (3) ICS, Inc. A summary of each bidder's information provided as requested and required to be considered as a responsive and responsible bidder follows the tabulated bid information:

Bidder	Base Bid Price	Alternate Bid Price
ICS, Inc.	\$6,496,900.00	\$6,506,050.00
Rice Lake Construction Group	\$6,787,321.50	\$6,800,741.50
ICS, Inc.	\$7,062,103.00	\$7,083,453.00
Engineers OPCC	\$6,577,323.00	\$ 6,592,573.00

PKG Contracting, Inc.

- 1) No irregularities were noted in the Bid Bond, Acknowledgement of Principal or Surety.
- 2) A North Dakota Class A Contractors License Certificate of Renewal was provided.
- 3) Receipt of Addenda 1 was acknowledged.
- 4) The EJCDC C-451 Qualification Statement was provided, including resumes of key personnel.
- 5) Failure to complete project and dispute history certification was provided with "None" indicated.
- 6) The list of subcontractors and suppliers was included.

Dan Jonasson

May 30, 2017

Re: Bid Review Opinion – City Project No. 4195.1

Page 2 of 3

Rice Lake Construction Group

- 1) No irregularities were noted in the Bid Bond, Acknowledgement of Principal or Surety.
- 2) A North Dakota Class A Contractors License Certificate of Renewal was provided.
- 3) Receipt of Addenda 1 was acknowledged.
- 4) The EJCDC C-451 Qualification Statement was provided, including resumes of key personnel.
- 5) Failure to complete project and dispute history certification was provided with “None” indicated.
- 6) The list of subcontractors and suppliers was included.

ICS, Inc.

- 1) No irregularities were noted in the Bid Bond, Acknowledgement of Principal or Surety.
- 2) A North Dakota Class A Contractors License Certificate of Renewal was provided.
- 3) Receipt of Addenda 1 was acknowledged.
- 4) The EJCDC C-451 Qualification Statement was provided, including resumes of key personnel.
- 5) Failure to complete project and dispute history certification was provided with “None” indicated.
- 6) The list of subcontractors and suppliers was not included.

BID SUMMARY:

Bid tabulation (attached) was performed to verify mathematical accuracy of total prices as unit prices control for any discrepancies. Analysis indicated that no discrepancies were noted on either PKG or Rice Lake Construction Group bids. A discrepancy was noted with ICS Inc. in that the total entered on the bid scheduled did not match the calculated total of all items. The \$5,000 discrepancy increased the total of the ICS bid but did not change the relative price position of bids.

Based on the bid tabulation, PKG Contracting Inc. is the Low Bidder for the referenced project.

BID ASSESSMENT:

The only issue noted during bid assessment other than the previously explained tabulation error in the ICS bid was the lack of a Subcontractor and Supplier List for the ICS Bid, as ICS was the 3rd lowest bidder this omission does not affect the outcome of the bid evaluation. PKG has been contacted and has stated they are comfortable with their bid and current workload in relation to completing the project on time. Based on their current project list and bonding capacity, PKG should be able to complete the project in a timely manner.

The low bid for the Project was approximately 1 percent (\$80,423.00) under the Engineers OPCC for the Work.

Dan Jonasson

May 30, 2017

Re: Bid Review Opinion – City Project No. 4195.1

Page 3 of 3

SUMMARY:

We recommend that the bid for Construction of the Sundre Raw Water Supply Reservoir and Pump Station (City Contract No. 4195.1) submitted by PKG Contracting Inc. in the amount of \$6,496,900.00 be accepted, with consideration given to accepting Additive Alternate No. 1 in the amount of \$9,150.00. The total contract price including the alternate would be \$6,506,050.00.

If you have any questions or require additional information, please contact me at (701) 751-6266 or by e-mail at akemmet@houstoneng.com .

Sincerely,

HOUSTON ENGINEERING, INC.

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Alan J. Kemmet, PE". The signature is stylized and cursive.

Alan J. Kemmet, PE
Principal/Project Manager

Attachments (1)

BID TABULATION
Sundre Reservoir and Pump Station
HEI Project 6027-048
City of Minot Project No. 4195.1

Engineer: Houston Engineering, Inc.
18 3rd Street SE Suite 100
Minot, ND 58701
Phone (701) 852-7931

Bid Opening: May 26, 2017
Time: 11:00 am

Item No.	Description	Unit	Quantity	Engineer's OPCC		PKG Contracting, Inc.		Rice Lake Construction		ICS, Inc.	
				Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost
A	Mobilization, Demobilizations, Bonds, Insurance	LS	1	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 200,000.00
B	Traffic Control and Signage	LS	1	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 1,500.00
C	Erosion Control	LS	1	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 17,000.00	\$ 17,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 7,500.00
D	City Well D Modifications										
1	Sundre Well D Electrical and SCADA Modifications	LS	1	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 53,000.00	\$ 53,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 55,000.00	\$ 55,000.00
2	Well D Modifications	LS	1	\$ 120,000.00	\$ 120,000.00	\$ 133,000.00	\$ 133,000.00	\$ 110,000.00	\$ 110,000.00	\$ 125,000.00	\$ 125,000.00
2	Well D embankment, grading, surfacing	LS	1	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 16,200.00	\$ 16,200.00
E	Site Work (Milestone 2)										
1	Clearing & Grubbing	AC	6.1	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 30,500.00	\$ 2,600.00	\$ 15,860.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 18,300.00	\$ 3,500.00	\$ 21,350.00
2	Tree Removal	LS	1	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 6,500.00	\$ 6,500.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00
3	Topsoil Stripping - 6"	CY	3,228	\$ 5.00	\$ 16,140.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 16,140.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 12,912.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 12,912.00
4	Topsoil Placement - 6"	CY	3,228	\$ 10.00	\$ 32,280.00	\$ 6.00	\$ 19,368.00	\$ 3.50	\$ 11,298.00	\$ 3.50	\$ 11,298.00
5	General Excavation	CY	25,250	\$ 5.00	\$ 126,250.00	\$ 4.50	\$ 113,625.00	\$ 4.50	\$ 113,625.00	\$ 3.00	\$ 75,750.00
6	Compacted Backfill	CY	20,000	\$ 10.00	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 3.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 80,000.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 40,000.00
7	6" Aggregate Surface Course	SY	3,677	\$ 20.00	\$ 73,540.00	\$ 18.00	\$ 66,186.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 18,385.00	\$ 5.50	\$ 20,223.50
8	Type R1 Geotextile	SY	3,677	\$ 3.00	\$ 11,031.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 7,354.00	\$ 3.50	\$ 12,869.50	\$ 3.50	\$ 12,869.50
9	Reinforced Concrete	CY	25	\$ 300.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 700.00	\$ 17,500.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 750.00	\$ 18,750.00
10	ECB Type 1	SY	590	\$ 3.00	\$ 1,770.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 1,180.00	\$ 1.60	\$ 944.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 1,180.00
	ECB Type 2	SY	7,360	\$ 3.00	\$ 22,080.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 14,720.00	\$ 1.60	\$ 11,776.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 14,720.00
11	Seeding & Mulching	AC	6	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 12,200.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 6,100.00	\$ 800.00	\$ 4,880.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 6,100.00
12	Trees (4' Ponderosa Pine)	EA	100	\$ 100.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 25,000.00
13	18" CMP with FES	LS	1	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 8,000.00
	24" CMP with FES	LS	1	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 9,500.00	\$ 9,500.00
	8" PC 350 RJ DI Water Main	LF	37	\$ 100.00	\$ 3,700.00	\$ 54.00	\$ 1,998.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 3,700.00	\$ 110.00	\$ 4,070.00
	18" PC 250 RJ DI Water Main	LF	37	\$ 261.00	\$ 9,657.00	\$ 165.00	\$ 6,105.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 7,400.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 9,250.00
	24" PC 200 RJ DI Water Main	LF	600	\$ 300.00	\$ 180,000.00	\$ 186.00	\$ 111,600.00	\$ 120.00	\$ 72,000.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 120,000.00
	24" PC 350 RJ DI Water Main	LF	34	\$ 300.00	\$ 10,200.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 6,800.00	\$ 125.00	\$ 4,250.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 8,500.00
	24" DI Fittings	EA	15	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 2,720.00	\$ 40,800.00	\$ 3,600.00	\$ 54,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 60,000.00
	18" Gate Valve	EA	2	\$ 19,000.00	\$ 38,000.00	\$ 13,400.00	\$ 26,800.00	\$ 14,500.00	\$ 29,000.00	\$ 18,000.00	\$ 36,000.00
	24" Gate Valve	EA	2	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 22,000.00	\$ 44,000.00	\$ 24,000.00	\$ 48,000.00	\$ 28,000.00	\$ 56,000.00
	Flushing & Pressure Testing	LS	1	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 24,500.00	\$ 24,500.00
14	Chain Link Fence and Gates	LS	1	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 19,000.00	\$ 19,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00
15	Site Electrical and Street Lighting	LS	1	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 435,000.00	\$ 435,000.00	\$ 395,000.00	\$ 395,000.00	\$ 430,000.00	\$ 430,000.00
16	Flow Meter Vault	LS	1	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 47,000.00	\$ 47,000.00	\$ 59,000.00	\$ 59,000.00	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 65,000.00
F	Sundre Pump Station Construction										
1	Foundation	LS	1	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 162,000.00	\$ 162,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 250,000.00
2	Building	LS	1	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 450,000.00	\$ 450,000.00	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 550,000.00	\$ 550,000.00
3	Process	LS	1	\$ 750,000.00	\$ 750,000.00	\$ 856,000.00	\$ 856,000.00	\$ 800,000.00	\$ 800,000.00	\$ 730,000.00	\$ 730,000.00
4	Industrial Coatings	LS	1	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 27,000.00	\$ 27,000.00	\$ 27,000.00	\$ 27,000.00	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 35,000.00
6	Electrical	LS	1	\$ 650,000.00	\$ 650,000.00	\$ 630,000.00	\$ 630,000.00	\$ 700,000.00	\$ 700,000.00	\$ 650,000.00	\$ 650,000.00
5	Mechanical - HVAC	LS	1	\$ 75,000.00	\$ 75,000.00	\$ 130,000.00	\$ 130,000.00	\$ 115,000.00	\$ 115,000.00	\$ 125,600.00	\$ 125,600.00
G	Minot Water Treatment Plant Work										
1	Structural	LS	1	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 70,000.00	\$ 70,000.00	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 125,000.00	\$ 125,000.00
2	Mechanical	LS	1	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 268,000.00	\$ 268,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 485,000.00	\$ 485,000.00
3	Industrial Coatings	LS	1	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 6,000.00
4	Pressure Reducing Station - Mechanical	LS	1	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00
5	Asphalt Removal	SY	75	\$ 10.00	\$ 750.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 750.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 750.00	\$ 25.00	\$ 1,875.00
6	6" Asphalt Patching	SY	75	\$ 75.00	\$ 5,625.00	\$ 70.00	\$ 5,250.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 3,750.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 7,500.00
7	Minot Water Treatment Plant Site Piping										
	30" DI Water Main	LF	645	\$ 400.00	\$ 258,000.00	\$ 290.00	\$ 187,050.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 193,500.00	\$ 325.00	\$ 209,625.00
	18" DI Water Main	LF	30	\$ 200.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 180.00	\$ 5,400.00	\$ 255.00	\$ 7,650.00	\$ 275.00	\$ 8,250.00
	8" Class	LF	111	\$ 100.00	\$ 11,100.00	\$ 69.00	\$ 7,659.00	\$ 72.00	\$ 7,992.00	\$ 80.00	\$ 8,880.00
	30" DI Fittings	EA	9	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 180,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 54,000.00	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 81,000.00	\$ 9,500.00	\$ 85,500.00
	18" DI Fittings	EA	2	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 1,650.00	\$ 3,300.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 4,000.00
	8" DI Fittings	EA	2	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 600.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$ 270.00	\$ 540.00	\$ 600.00	\$ 1,200.00
	30" Gate Valve	EA	4	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 38,500.00	\$ 154,000.00	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 140,000.00	\$ 37,500.00	\$ 150,000.00
	18" Gate Valve	EA	1	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 13,000.00	\$ 13,000.00	\$ 14,500.00	\$ 14,500.00	\$ 17,000.00	\$ 17,000.00
	8" Gate Valve	EA	1	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 3,000.00
	Minot Water Treatment Plant Connection	EA	1	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 59,000.00	\$ 59,000.00	\$ 58,000.00	\$ 58,000.00	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 65,000.00
	Raw Water Flushing Connection	EA	1	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 8,500.00	\$ 8,500.00
	NAWS Pipeline Connection	EA	1	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 55,000.00	\$ 55,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00
	NAWS Pipeline Flushing and Pressure Testing (Milestone 3)	LS	1	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 18,000.00	\$ 18,000.00
H	Sundre Reservoir Construction (Milestone 2)										
1	Sundre Reservoir Foundation	LS	1	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 640,955.00	\$ 640,955.00	\$ 443,500.00	\$ 443,500.00	\$ 575,000.00	\$ 575,000.00
2	Sundre Reservoir Walls	LS	1	\$ 580,000.00	\$ 580,000.00	\$ 425,000.00	\$ 425,000.00	\$ 350,000.00	\$ 350,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00
3	Sundre Reservoir Roof and Roof Supports	LS	1	\$ 575,000.00	\$ 575,000.00	\$ 520,000.00	\$ 520,000.00	\$ 600,000.00	\$ 600,000.00	\$ 539,000.00	\$ 539,000.00
4	Sundre Reservoir Insulation	LS	1	\$ 125,000.00	\$ 125,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 125,000.00	\$ 125,000.00
5	Sundre Reservoir Mechanical	LS	1	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 7,000.00	\$ 7,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 55,000.00	\$ 55,000.00
6	Sundre Reservoir Electrical	LS	1	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 7,500.00
I	Wellfield Work										
1	Afterbay transmission line plug	LS	1	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 12,000.00
2	Well A, B, and E Control and SCADA Modifications	EA	3	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 18,000.00	\$ 54,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 60,000.00
3	Well C Control and SCADA Modifications	LS	1	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 7,000.00	\$ 7,000.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 7,500.00
AA-1	Hydraulic Seed and Mulch	AC	6	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 15,250.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 9,150.00	\$ 2,200.00	\$ 13,420.00	\$ 3,500.00	\$ 21,350.00
BASE BID TOTAL					\$ 6,577,323.00		\$ 6,496,900.00		\$ 6,787,321.50		\$ 7,062,103.00
BID WITH ALTERNATE TOTAL					\$ 6,592,573.00		\$ 6,506,050.00		\$ 6,800,741.50		\$ 7,083,453.00